Examining Communication Satisfaction, Confucian Work Dynamism and Job Satisfaction: A Comparative Study of International and Domestic Hotels in Hainan, China

Wang Hua  
School of Communication  
Universiti Sains Malaysia

Bahiyah Omar  
School of Communication  
Universiti Sains Malaysia

© The Author(s) 2016. This article is published with open access by Taylor’s Press.

ABSTRACT
This study examines hotel employees’ communication satisfaction and job satisfaction levels in Hainan, China. The Communication Satisfaction Questionnaire (CSQ) and the Job Descriptive Index (JDI) were used in the investigation. This study also measures the Chinese working culture, Confucian work dynamism, and examines its relationship with hotel employees’ attitudes toward communication and job satisfaction. Using a survey and stratified sampling techniques, 40 sets of data were obtained from the staff working at four domestic and four international hotels operating in Hainan. Data were analysed using PLS analysis. The testing of measurement model shows that communication satisfaction measure for international hotel model was different from the measure for domestic hotel model. The results of structural model testing, on the other hand, show that both organisational communication satisfaction and Confucian work dynamism had significant effects on job satisfaction. Confucian work dynamism positively interacted with communication satisfaction in predicting job satisfaction, making it a significant moderator to the relationship between communication satisfaction and job satisfaction. All these relationships were found significant in both conditions; international and domestic hotels. The test of significant difference between the two models, however, yielded insignificant results. The findings suggest that effects of communication satisfaction and Confucian work dynamism on job satisfaction were almost equal at international and domestic hotels.

Keywords: organisational communication satisfaction; job satisfaction; Confucian work dynamism; international hotel; domestic hotel; Hainan

1. INTRODUCTION
China is the largest country in the Asia-Pacific region and an active member of the Pacific Asia Travel Association (PATA). In 2013, PATA announced that China’s tourism industry was likely to remain the largest and fastest growing industry in the Asia-Pacific region over the following five years. According to the World Travel and Tourism Council (World Travel and Tourism Council, 2014), China has become the world’s second largest tourism economy since 2012 and is expected to become
the world’s largest by 2023. China’s National Tourism Administration (CNTA) reported that there were 11,874 star rated hotels in China as of the end of 2012 and that 654 of these hotels have been rated five-star (Liu, 2013).

The smallest coastal province in China, Hainan province is located in the southernmost part of the country and has variously been referred to as the ‘Hawaii of the East’ (Zhao & Huang, 17 March 2010), ‘China’s Dubai’ (Sun, 25 February 2013), and the ‘Hometown of Miss World’ (China Daily, 3 December 2004; China Daily, 31 October 2010). Since being honoured as an International Tourism Destination in 2010 Hainan has witnessed the fastest hotel expansion rate in China and the central government has announced plans to develop the island into a major international tourist destination by 2020 (Huang & Wang, 29 November 2012). Being China’s only tropical island province and largest special economic zone, Hainan has the potential to become a world-class tourism destination by 2020 (World Travel and Tourism Council, 2014). According to the China Hotel Association (2012), Hainan had 536 licensed hotels, including 53 five-star hotels, in 2012. Consequently, Hainan has the highest five-star hotel density in China. The rate of increase in the number of licensed hotels in Hainan over a six year period can be seen in Figure 1.

In 2009, China had the second largest hotel development pipeline globally. And while international hotel operators have been responsible for many of these new hotel developments, new domestic hotel operators also have been aggressively pursuing their hotel networks. Therefore, the rapid expansion of international hotels, coupled with the global economic downturn has made China’s hotel industry highly competitive (CBRE Research, 2009).

Nevertheless, despite the rapid development of hotels in Hainan, the province faces major obstacles in reaching its goal of becoming Asia-Pacific’s top holiday destination. Lack of skilled personnel and poor service standards in Hainan’s tourism and hospitality industries have been a persistent problem (Hong, 2011).

According to a nationwide survey conducted by the Meadin Tourism Research Institute (China’s largest hotel information centre), 51% of hotel employees were dissatisfied with their current jobs and 43% were inclined to change their jobs every 1 – 3 years (Zhou, 2012). Furthermore, 97% of hotel employees were cognisant of the importance of effective communication in the work place, 99% reported encountering significant communication barriers. To be more specific, 45% of workplace communication difficulties involved cross-departmental communication, while 32% involved supervisory communication (Traub, 2012).

Job dissatisfaction seems to be an alarming issue in China’s hotel industry. Central to this is the problem of workplace communication which is an impediment to the industry competitiveness. Downs and Hazen (1977) suggested that communication played an important role in every organisation and was therefore a central process. Communication relates to organisational concepts such as job performance and job satisfaction (Pincus, 1986; Roberts & O’Reilly, 1974), organisational commitment (Carriere & Bourque, 2009; Varona, 1996), as well as employee turnover intention (Jablin & Putnam, 2001). Furthermore, culture has emerged as an important subject in management studies as a result of the globalisation of the economy (Sheridan, 1992). Hunter (1993) suggested that communication practices in different cultures might have a substantive impact on the effectiveness of management operations. Kerr and Slocum (1987) indicated that employee retention was related to cultural orientation, as culture might cause differences in human resource strategies, such as employee promotion procedures and reward systems, which are the two frequently identified factors affecting employees’ job satisfaction.

We examine Chinese hotel employees’ perceptions of their organizational communication practices and job satisfaction, as well as the impact of Confucian work dynamism on the two constructs. The objective is to discover the relationship between communication satisfaction and job satisfaction in Hainan’s hotel industry in the context of Chinese working environment. Specifically, we sought to examine:

- The relationship between organizational communication satisfaction and job satisfaction, and the moderating effect of Confucian work dynamism on that relationship
- The difference between international and domestic hotel organizational contexts in the significance of relationships among communication satisfaction, Confucian work dynamism and job satisfaction

The study extends the body of knowledge by examining the moderating role of Chinese working culture (that is: Confucian work dynamism) on the relationship between communication satisfaction and job satisfaction. Existing literature shows job satisfaction relates closely to communication satisfaction but most often fails to examine the effects of culture in explaining the relationship. The study adds to the paucity of literature focusing on the importance of organisational communication satisfaction, local culture and job satisfaction in different organizational context (international vs domestic hotels) in an Asian country.
2. LITERATURE REVIEW

2.1 Communication satisfaction

According to Hecht (1978), satisfaction is an effective response based on people’s fulfillment of expectation-type of standard. Communication satisfaction then was defined as the personal satisfaction inherent in successfully communicating to someone or in successfully being communicated with (Thayer, 1968, p. 144). Communication satisfaction construct has been used in three distinct contexts: interpersonal, group, and organizational (Hecht, 1978). In the organizational context, there are two dominant perspectives on communication; process and perception (Pincus, 1986). According to the process perspective, organizational communication is “the process of creating, exchanging, interpreting, and storing messages within a system of human interrelationships. The process is closely related to the exchange of messages and direction of information flow. Andrews and Herschel (1996) state that information flow in organization has three directions; downward, upward and horizontal. The flow depends on the structure of the organization (Pincus, 1986).

On the other hand, the other perspective concerns with perception or attitude. It is through communication that people get to know what they are expected to do in their jobs, understand the business objectives and become aware of what others think of their work. According to Schuler (1995), effective communication is important because it is related to employee work attitude. One of the earliest researchers examining this perspective was Herzberg (1966), who claimed that communication was one of the ten original hygiene factors that lead to his Motivation – Hygiene theory (also known as the Two Factor theory). Later, Downs (1971) developed the concept of Organizational Communication Satisfaction to be used in examining communication – satisfaction relationship, and it became a common reference in organizational studies and literatures.

Organizational communication satisfaction is an abstract concept. Downs (1971) defined this concept as a general feeling which an employee has towards his total communication environment. Meanwhile, Crino and White (1981) defined it as an employee’s affective appraisal of the organisation’s communication practices; it is the satisfaction with various aspects of communication in an organisation. In a similar vein, Nakra (1984) claimed that organisational communication satisfaction could be described as a person’s satisfaction with information flow and relationship variables within an organisation. Downs and Hazen (1977) further claimed that organisational communication satisfaction is a multi-dimensional construct. They introduced eight communication satisfaction dimensions (Table 1) that make up Communication Satisfaction Questionnaire (CSQ) as a useful tool to access communication satisfaction in an organization.

The Communication Satisfaction Questionnaire (CSQ) has been well received by scholars and researchers. It has been praised as the best measure of communication satisfaction in organizational arena (Clampitt & Downs, 1993). It has been applied in various organizational contexts such as in information and technology (Castro & Martins, 2010) hospitality (Clampitt & Downs, 1993) and lodging (Mount & Back, 1999) sectors.

2.2 Job satisfaction

Locke (1969) described job satisfaction as a state of pleasure which can be gained by implementing one's value on one's job. A commonly cited definition of job satisfaction is “a pleasurable or positive emotional state resulting from one's job or job experiences” (Locke, 1976, p. 1300). Job satisfaction has been found to be linked with positive employee outcomes and organisation performance, such as increased job performance, productivity and efficiency, workplace safety and job security, as well as employee motivation (Aziri, 2011; Herzberg, 1966; Spector, 1997). Numerous studies have shown that dissatisfied employees are more likely to quit their jobs or to be absent than satisfied ones (Hulin, Roznowski & Hachiya, 1985; Scott & Taylor, 1985; Spector, 1985; Tian, 2009; Yücel, 2012). Studies have also found that dissatisfied employees would lead to various kinds of withdrawal behaviors, such as occupational stress, lateness, absenteeism, unionization, grievance, drug abuse, intention to quit, and decision to retire (Bavelas & Barrett, 1951; Chu, 2010; Clampitt & Downs, 1993; Davis & Newstrom, 1989 et al). Such, job satisfaction can function like a buffer against situations favoring these negative outcomes (Irvine & Evans, 1995; Lance, 1991). Judge and Watanabe (1994) even suggested that for most employees, job satisfaction and life satisfaction were positively correlated.

Armstrong (2003, p. 190 – 240) claims that job satisfaction is under the influence...
of many external and internal factors, including intrinsic and extrinsic motivating factors, social relationships with work group, employees’ abilities to do their work, and the quality of supervision. A study by Chu (2010) emphasised the importance of career advancement opportunities in job satisfaction. Besides, pay and welfare were found to be important as well in satisfying and retaining qualified employees. This was supported by Ali and Akhter (2009), Faruqui and Islam (2005), as well as Mount and Bartlett (2002), in which they found that salary and benefit were the most dissatisfactory issues in education sector.

In job satisfaction related literatures, several popular job satisfaction instruments have been developed by different scholars. Among them are the Minnesota Satisfaction Questionnaire (MSQ) developed by Weiss, Davis, England, and Lofquist (1967), the Job Satisfaction Survey (JSS) developed by Spector (1985), the Job Diagnostic Survey (JDS) developed by Hackman and Oldham (1975). However, some scholars (Sledge, Miles & Sambeck, 2011; Spector, 1985) argue that most of these instruments were developed in respect to industrial and manufacturing organisations and may not be applicable to be used in the service industry. Meanwhile, Scarpello and Campbell (1983) argued that individual questions about different aspects of the job could not correlate well with a global measure of overall job satisfaction. Of all the measurements, the Job Description Index (JDI) developed by Smith, Kendall, and Hulin (1969) is among the most frequently used scales and the most carefully developed one for measuring job satisfaction in quantitative studies.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Dimension</th>
<th>Definition</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1 Pay and benefit</td>
<td>satisfaction with one's salary, bonuses, fringe benefits, opportunity to earn more money, and pay comparison</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 Work itself</td>
<td>satisfaction with one's work load, work flexibility, job security, work environment, job safety, and feeling of accomplishment.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 Promotion opportunity</td>
<td>employees’ satisfaction with their opportunities for higher level jobs, more responsibility, personal growth, positive recognition and training.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 Supervision</td>
<td>satisfaction with a superior’s management capability, fairness of judgment, effectiveness of communication, support and guidance.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 Co-workers</td>
<td>satisfaction with appreciation from coworkers, teamwork, and overall relationship.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 2. Dimensions of job satisfaction by Smith, Kendall and Hulin (1969)

It has the greatest acceptance among management researchers as it is a simple, applicable, and reliable method; and it has been widely used in human industry, offers an impressive array of validation evidence, and covers the major aspects of job satisfaction (Aziri, 2011). According to Smith, Kendall, and Hulin (1969), job satisfaction is considered as an attitude and there are five facets of employees’ attitude toward their job (see Table 2).

The important link between organizational communication and job satisfaction has been established in many studies. Downs and Hazen (1977) used the eight communication factors to test their effects on job satisfaction. Their study revealed that personal feedback, supervisory communication, and the communication climate were the three factors that most closely correlated with job satisfaction. In another study, Clampitt and Downs (1993) discovered that supervisory communication and subordinate communication were the two factors that most closely interacted with job satisfaction, whereas personal feedback provided the least correlation with job satisfaction. Meanwhile, Mount and Back (1999) combined media quality and organizational integration into “vertical communication”, and suggested that supervisory communication, communication climate, and vertical communication were most strongly correlated with job satisfaction. Another study by Downs and Adrian (2004, p. 155) stated that, in addition to supervisory communication, communication climate and personal feedback were also found to be strongly correlated with job satisfaction. Castro and Martins (2010) found a strong positive correlation between communication climate and job satisfaction.

Previous studies (Carriere & Bourque, 2009; Downs & Adrian, 2004; Muchinsky, 1989; Pincus, 1986; Roberts & O’Reilly, 1974) have suggested that high-quality communication was associated with relatively high levels of job satisfaction, whereas low-quality communication was associated with relatively low levels of job satisfaction. However, there are some studies which failed to support the relationship between communication and job satisfaction (Muchinsky, 1989; Pincus, 1993). These studies found that employees’ work attitude could be moderated by other factors including employees’ abilities, personalities, job benefits, and so forth.

2.3 The role of Confucian work dynamism

According to Hofstede (1991), Chinese culture is significantly influenced by the philosophy of Confucianism, which is not a religion but a set of guidelines for proper behaviours. Fan (2000) also stated that Chinese culture is a set of unique core culture values, which provides guidance for social interaction among Chinese people and remained relatively stable over a long period of time. Confucianism is one of the most important components of Chinese traditional culture (Fan, 2000; Wang et al., 2005). Confucianism is the moral and behavioural framework based on teaching of Confucius developed by the great Chinese philosopher and educator – Confucius (551 - 479 BC). Although it is not a religion, Confucianism has been setting principles of shaping moral, political, economic and social life of Chinese people more than two thousand years (Wang et al., 2005); it is arguably the greatest philosophical influence in China and is widespread throughout Asian countries (Warden, Chen, & Caskey, 2005).

Hofstede (1980) identified four dimensions of cultural diversity: Power Distance, Individualism, Masculinity and Uncertainty Avoidance, in order to
prove the existing diversities in 40 countries around the world. Recognising the influence of the diffusion of Confucius on the East, and to avoid Western mind set biases, Hofstede and Bond (1988) included the Long-Term Orientation as the fifth dimension. They defined it as respect of tradition, preference towards face saving and long-term goal preferences and objectives over short-term ones. Hofstede (1993) named this fifth dimension as Confucian Dynamism to show that it deals completely with Confucius’ teaching and its positive side reflects a dynamic, future-oriented mentality, whereas its negative side reflects a static and tradition-oriented mentality. Alder, Campell, and Laurent (1989) argued that since several cultural scholars have realised and warned that researchers should not overlook the limitations of applying and extending western-based cultural constructs and measurements to non-western countries, Hofstede’s culture measurement tool was then culturally limited as it was completely developed based on the western culture. Whereas, the Chinese values from the Chinese Culture Connection (1987) was a completely China-based measurement and it could capture the distinctive features of Chinese culture.

According to Chinese Culture Connection (1987), there are 40 key Chinese cultural values which could be grouped into four categories: Social Integration, Human – Heartedness, Confucian Work Dynamism, and Moral Discipline. Hofstede and Bond (1988) and Wu and Chiang (2007) argued that Confucian Work Dynamism was most related to Chinese people’s work, and defined Confucian work dynamism as “the extent to which an individual conforms to such values as persistence, ordering relationships by status, and having a sense of shame. It emphasises the compliance with work ethics and the enjoyment of prestige while maintaining status and reputation”. By reference of related literature – especially the 40 core Chinese cultural values in Chinese Culture Connection (1987) – the current study delimits Confucian work dynamism into the six factors (Table 3).

Although research on organisational communication in the Chinese cultural context is limited, there have been increasing efforts during the past few years. There are a few studies conducted in China which have proved that the effectiveness of organisational communication is partly influenced by Confucian ideology, such as long term orientation and respect for one’s superiors (Miao, Adler & Xu, 2010; Shin, Ishman & Sanders, 2007). Shin, Ishman and Sanders (2007) examined whether the Confucian dynamism was a cultural factor that influenced information sharing in organisations. In this context, Guan Xi was thus viewed as a strong societal relationship involving mutual trust-based relationship that influenced information sharing in China. The study by Miao, Adler, and Xu (2010) in exploring cross-cultural issues faced by hotel expatriate managers in China revealed that communication was the most challenging issue in dealing with various stakeholders especially government officials, and the most prevailing cultural issues which frustrated them were Guan Xi and Protecting One’s Face. Examining the difference of job satisfaction between Mainland China and Taiwan, Wu, Tsai and Lin (1999) found that the employee satisfaction of both Taiwanese employees and Chinese employees were influenced by cultural factors.

3. THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK AND HYPOTHESES STATEMENTS

Based on the literature review, the relationship between communication satisfaction and job satisfaction has already been established in many studies (e.g: Carriere & Bourque, 2009; Downs & Adrian, 2004; Muchinsky, 1989; Pincus, 1986; Roberts & O’Reilly, 1974). There are, however, some studies (e.g: Muchinsky, 1989; Pinchus, 1993) which found no support for the relationship and suggested the possibility of moderating effects of other factors. In another line of research on cultural effects, the influence of cultural factors on employees’ job satisfaction has also been supported (Wu, Tsai & Lin, 1999). Hence, the current study links these studies and suggests the moderating effect of Confucian work dynamism on the relationship between communication satisfaction and job satisfaction.

![Figure 2. Conceptual framework](image)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Dimension</th>
<th>Source</th>
<th>Definition</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1 Collectivism</td>
<td>Hofstede (1997)</td>
<td>the degree to which people prefer to act as members of groups rather than as individuals</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 Loyalty to supervisor</td>
<td>Wu and Chiang (2007)</td>
<td>respecting and staying loyal to the superior</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 Protecting one’s face</td>
<td>Wang et al. (2005)</td>
<td>the social manner of respecting others’ social status and reputation in a society, and avoid direct conflict in order to maintain harmony in the society</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 Guan Xi</td>
<td>Yeung and Tung (1996)</td>
<td>the social and economic network relationship based on trust and personal friendship rather than the formal contractual relationship</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 Hierarchical relationship by status</td>
<td>Scollon and Jones (2011)</td>
<td>the people who recognises and respects the social differences which place one person in a superordinate position and the other one in a subordinate position</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6 Taking a long-term view</td>
<td>Hofstede and Bond (1988)</td>
<td>the degree to which people respect tradition, prefer to save face in relationships, and emphasise long-term goals and objectives over short-term goals and objectives</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 3. Dimensions of Confucian Work Dynamism
communication satisfaction on job satisfaction (see Figure 2).

Past research examining hospitality industry in the United States (e.g: Clampitt & Girard, 1993; Varona, 1996; Clampitt & Downs, 1993) found that communication satisfaction has significant effect on job satisfaction. We argue that the effect could be different from one type of hotel to another. Hence, this study is interested to examine the disparity between China’s domestic and international hotels. There is evidence that show China’s domestic hotels recruited 53% employees annually in comparison to international hotels which recruited significantly less “new” employees at just 22.6% annually (Traub, 2012). At the same time, CBRE Research (2009) and Okoroafo et al. (2010) both reported that international hotels outperformed China's domestic hotels based on their service quality controls and the professionalism of their management. Hence, we test the framework model on two groups of employees: International and Domestic hotels in Hainan. We hypothesize greater effects to be found in international hotel than domestic hotel for each of the relationships. Hence, we propose the following hypotheses:

H1a: Communication satisfaction will significantly affect job satisfaction.
H1b: Communication satisfaction effect on job satisfaction will be greater for International than Domestic hotels

Lu, Gilmour and Kao (2001) claimed that Confucian work dynamism as the work ethic, demonstrated a cultural effect on happiness in both East and West. As work occupies a larger part of people's life, the implementation of work ethics should have a universal positive effect on happiness. Furthermore, Shin, Ishman and Sanders (2007) proposed that Confucian work dynamism could influence information sharing in organizations, and Guan Xi showed the strongest power in information sharing. In the context of the current study, we examine beyond the specific category of Chinese work culture in order to understand the impact of Confucian work dynamism, as a whole, on hotel employees’ perceptions of job satisfaction in both international and domestic hotels. Thus, we hypothesize the following hypotheses:

H2a: Confucian work dynamism will significantly affect job satisfaction
H2b: Confucian work dynamism effect on job satisfaction will be greater for International than Domestic hotel

Communication and job satisfaction have been popular topics at various organizations in Western countries especially in the United States (Clampitt & Downs, 1993; Mount & Back, 1999; Pincus, 1986; Schuler, 1995; Varona, 1996). However, our understanding of the relationship between communication and job satisfaction and how does local culture influence such relationship is limited. There is little evidence to show how culture affects job satisfaction as well as its moderating role to facilitate the effect. Hence, we test the main effect of Confucian work dynamism on job satisfaction and also its interaction with communication satisfaction in predicting job satisfaction. We propose the following hypotheses:

H3a: Communication satisfaction and Confucian work dynamism will interact in predicting job satisfaction
H3b: Confucian work dynamism will be a more important predictor of job satisfaction for International than Domestic hotel

4. METHODOLOGY

4.1. Sample and procedures
We employed a self-administered questionnaire survey for this study. Eight five-star hotels were selected through stratified and systematic sampling with random start techniques. The sampling frame involved a list of 53 five-star hotels in Hainan. These 53 hotels were sub-divided into two categories consisting of 27 domestic five-star hotels and 26 franchised international hotels, and hotel names were listed separately for each category, in alphabetical order. In order to prevent any possible bias, the first element was selected at random. This random selection procedure resulted in the sixth hotel being selected first, followed by the twelfth, eighteenth, and twenty-fourth. In the end, four hotels were selected from each category. Altogether there were eight hotels selected.

Human Resource directors from the eight hotels were contacted to solicit their permission to distribute the questionnaires. All questionnaires, with introduction and invitation letters, were sent to the human resource directors who then passed the questionnaires on to each departmental head. In order to maintain the confidentiality of respondents, the respondents were asked not to record their names on the questionnaires, and they were instructed to place the completed questionnaires in a paper box upon completion. Ultimately, 700 respondents (full-time employees) answered the survey questionnaire and 408 valid questionnaires were used in this study.

4.2. Measures
This study used an open-ended survey questionnaire for data collection, and all three variables (communication satisfaction, job satisfaction, and Confucian work dynamism) were measured by using validated items from pre-existing measurements derived from the literature. Organisational communication satisfaction and job satisfaction were measured on a five-point Likert-type scale with anchors ranging from ‘1= strongly disagree’ to ‘5= strongly agree’. Confucian work dynamism was also measured on a five-point Likert-type scale with anchors ranging from ‘1= not important at all’ to ‘5= very important’. The Organisational CSQ, developed by Downs and Hazen (1977) was used to assess organisational communication. This tool measures eight communication satisfaction factors: corporate information, organisational integration, media quality, supervisory communication, subordinate communication, co-worker
communication, personal feedback and communication climate. Job satisfaction was measured using the Job Description Index (JDX) developed by Smith, Kendall and Hulin (1969). This tool measures five facets of job satisfaction: pay and benefits, the job itself, co-workers, and supervision and promotion opportunities. Confucian work dynamism was developed based on the construct described in Chinese Culture Connection, 1987, which was used to examine hotel employees’ attitudes toward traditional Chinese working culture. The six factors of Confucian work dynamism measured were collectivism, loyalty to supervisors, protecting one’s face, Guan Xi (i.e. interpersonal relationship), hierarchical relationships by status and taking a long-term view.

Structural Equation Modelling (SEM) was used for the data analysis. SEM has the benefit of minimizing measurement errors and simultaneous reporting of moderation (as well as mediation) effect using a path modelling structure. The analysis of data was performed using partial least square (PLS) using Smart PLS version 3.0. Two models representing two types of hotels (i.e. international and domestic) were deduced from the analysis.

5. RESULTS
This study used two –step analytical procedure; assessments of the measurement model and then the structural model. We derive structural models for international hotel and domestic hotel from the analysis and the results were compared to see the difference between two types of hotel environment.

5.1 The Measurement Model
The results of measurement model testing are presented in Table 4 and Table 5. All item loadings in Table 4 were greater than 0.70 and all our reflective measures fulfilled the recommended levels of composite reliability and average variance extracted. All variables had composite reliability of 0.70 and above and average variance extracted of 0.50 and more. Table 4 shows that first order constructs that make up communication satisfaction at international hotels are organizational integration, personal feedback, corporate information, communication climate, supervisory communication and co-worker communication. Meanwhile, media quality and subordinate communication were excluded from the measurement of communication satisfaction in this model.

The testing of measurement model for domestic hotel also yields significant results. The recommended levels of item loadings (> 0.70), composite reliability (CR > 0.07) and average variance extracted (AVE > 0.05) were fulfilled. Table 5 shows that communication satisfaction at domestic hotel was reflectively measured by fewer constructs; organizational integration, personal feedback, communication climate, supervisory communication and media quality, than international hotel model. Out of eight constructs proposed by Downs and Hazen (1977), we found that supervisory communication, subordinate communication and co-worker communication were not reflective measures of communication satisfaction in domestic hotel model.
5.2 The Structural Model

Assessment of structural model involves examining the model's predictive capabilities and the relationships between constructs. Figure 3 presents the results of PLS analysis for both models. Communication satisfaction had significant impact on job satisfaction in both models with path coefficients of 0.529 and 0.510 respectively. Confucian work dynamism also had significant effect on job satisfaction in international hotel model (0.340) and domestic model (0.240). We also found that Confucian work dynamism interacted with communication satisfaction in predicting job satisfaction, with smaller path coefficient for domestic model (0.096) than international model (0.186). The constructs accounted for 56% of variance explained in international model while domestic model with 43% variance explained.

We performed test of significance of all paths using the bootstrap resampling procedure. Table 6 presents the results of hypothesis testing for the hypothesized relationships. The results show that there were significant effects of communication satisfaction and Confucian work dynamism on job satisfaction. Hence H1a and H2a were accepted. We also found significant moderating effect of Confucian work dynamism on the link between communication satisfaction and job satisfaction. H3a was also supported.

### Table 6

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Model</th>
<th>Hypothesis</th>
<th>Path Coefficients</th>
<th>t-values</th>
<th>Sig. Level</th>
<th>p values</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>International</td>
<td>Comm → Job</td>
<td>0.529</td>
<td>9.163</td>
<td>***</td>
<td>0.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>CWD → Job</td>
<td>0.340</td>
<td>4.949</td>
<td>***</td>
<td>0.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Comm*CWD → Job</td>
<td>0.186</td>
<td>4.143</td>
<td>***</td>
<td>0.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Domestic</td>
<td>Comm → Job</td>
<td>0.510</td>
<td>8.109</td>
<td>***</td>
<td>0.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>CWD → Job</td>
<td>0.240</td>
<td>3.568</td>
<td>***</td>
<td>0.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Comm*CWD → Job</td>
<td>0.096</td>
<td>2.079</td>
<td>**</td>
<td>0.038</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: NS = not significant. *p<.10  **p<.05  ***p<.01

In testing interaction effect using PLS, the hierarchical process was used to compare the R² values between main effect and interaction effect models for each category of hotel. The difference in R² was used to access the overall effect size f² for the interaction. We refer to Cohen's (1988) procedure of determining effect size where 0.02, 0.15 and 0.35 had been suggested as small, moderate and large effects respectively. Table 7 shows that for both international and domestic hotel conditions, the model in which Confucian work dynamism was proposed to moderate the relationship between communication satisfaction and job satisfaction possessed a significantly higher explanatory power than the main effect model. The effect size for interaction was small (< 0.15).

### Table 7

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Model</th>
<th>R²</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>International</td>
<td>0.498</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Interaction effect model</td>
<td>0.557</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>f²</td>
<td>0.118</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Domestic</td>
<td>0.416</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Interaction effect model</td>
<td>0.426</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>f²</td>
<td>0.017</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

\[ f² = [R² (interaction effect model) - R² (main effect model)] / [1 - R² (main effect model)]. \]
A multi-group analysis was conducted to determine whether the effects of all relationships were greater for international hotel model than domestic hotel model. Table 8 shows that there were no significant differences between international hotel and domestic hotel concerning the effects of communication satisfaction \((t = 0.222, p=0.825)\) and Confucian work dynamism \((t = 1.020, p=0.308)\) on job satisfaction as well as the moderated effect of Confucian work dynamism on the relationship between communication satisfaction and job satisfaction \((t = 1.444, p=0.149)\). The test for significant differences between the two models were not supported. Hence, H1b, H2b and H3b were not supported.

Table 8

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>International</th>
<th>Domestic</th>
<th>International vs Domestic</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(p^{(1)})</td>
<td>(p^{(2)})</td>
<td>(t)-value</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comm (\rightarrow) Job</td>
<td>0.529</td>
<td>0.058</td>
<td>0.510</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CWD (\rightarrow) Job</td>
<td>0.340</td>
<td>0.072</td>
<td>0.240</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comm*Confucian Work Dynamism (\rightarrow) Job</td>
<td>0.186</td>
<td>0.042</td>
<td>0.096</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: NS = not significant, \(p^{(1)} < 0.10 \) **\(p < 0.05 \) ***\(p < 0.01 \)

Out of six hypotheses tested in this study, three hypotheses were supported while the rest were not supported. All hypothesized paths in both models were found to be statistically significant (H1a, H2a and H3a) while all test of differences between the two models were found to be statistically insignificant (H1b, H2b and H3b).

6. DISCUSSIONS

Our model builds upon the model linking communication satisfaction and job satisfaction by adding Chinese working culture (that is: Confucian work dynamism) as a moderator. The study uses the Communication Satisfaction Questionnaire (CSQ) developed by Downs and Hazen (1977) to access the level of communication satisfaction in two different types of hotels (international vs domestic). The CSQ outlines eight dimensions of organizational communication satisfaction and we adopted all dimensions in this study. Interestingly, we found that dimensions of communication satisfaction for international hotels differ from domestic hotels. Communication satisfaction at international hotels was reflected by six dimensions; excluding media quality and subordinate communication. Meanwhile, reflective measures for communication satisfaction at domestic hotels include five dimensions of which supervisory communication, subordinate communication and co-worker communication were excluded from the analysis due to low loadings.

It is indicated in the findings that subordinates’ responsiveness towards communication with superiors, that is subordinate communication, was excluded in the measurement of communication satisfaction for both models. This could be explained by the fact that communication between subordinates and superiors might be impeded by Chinese cultural values such as Guan Xi and Protecting One’s Face. Miao, Adler and Xu (2010) found these two values had caused frustration in communication. The need to develop mutual trust-based relationship (that is: Guan Xi) and respect to superior’s social status (Protecting One’s Face) may cause low responsiveness among subordinates. This could explain why subordinate communication was not a significant predictor to communication satisfaction.

Media quality, another dimension of communication satisfaction, was excluded from the measurement model of international hotel but not domestic hotel. This dimension refers to the quality, in terms of clarity and brevity, of written messages and directives as practised in the organization. It is tempting to suggest that the use of English language at international hotels could provide some explanation to this finding. Due to unfamiliarity with English, hotel employees at international hotel rated low satisfaction in media quality, and thus eliminating it from becoming a significant indicator of communication satisfaction. This issue may not be prevalent at domestic hotels. Thus, media quality was found to be a reflective measure of communication satisfaction at domestic hotel.

Supervisory communication and co-worker communication were excluded from the measurement model of domestic hotels. Domestic hotel employees might perceived a lack of effort from supervisors to understand feelings and problems faced by subordinate (supervisory communication) and they were also doubtful of the accuracy of information communicated in horizontal and informal communication (co-worker communication) at the work place. Chinese working culture that upholds the importance of hierarchical relationship by status could explain why supervisory communication does not contribute to organizational communication satisfaction. Meanwhile, the social manner of protecting one’s face may contribute to the feeling of distrust at the level of co-worker communication. The influence of Chinese culture might be more prevailing at domestic hotels as compared to international hotels.

Our findings presented strong support to the existing theoretical link between communication satisfaction and job satisfaction. The new hypothesized path of the moderating effect of Confucian work dynamism on the link was also supported. The current study revealed that Confucian work dynamism was perceived as an integral component of the working culture, and that communication satisfaction proved to be a more influential than Confucian work dynamism in predicting job satisfaction. The results has established the strength of the relationship between communication satisfaction and job satisfaction. This finding confirms the results of previous studies, that communication satisfaction is significantly and positively correlated with job satisfaction (Clampitt & Downs, 1993; Downs & Adrain; 2004; Downs & Hazen, 1977; Madlock, 2008). When examined together with the effects of Confucian work dynamism, communication satisfaction had a more significant effect on job satisfaction than culture.

According to Carriere and Bourque (2009), the relationship between communication and job satisfaction is moderated by the type of organisation. We found, on the other hand, that the relationship is moderated by Confucian
work dynamism. Chinese culture, Confucian work dynamism, interacted with communication satisfaction in predicting job satisfaction. Confusion work dynamism affected job satisfaction directly (main effect) and in combination with communication satisfaction (interaction effect). Although the size of interaction effect was small, it does not necessarily imply an unimportant effect.

When the hypothesized relationships were compared between the two types of hotels, the results show that path coefficients for international hotel model were higher than domestic hotel model. A test of significant difference between the two models, however, suggests that the difference for each relationship was negligible. Job satisfaction at international hotels and domestic hotels was explained by both communication satisfaction and Confucian work dynamism as well as interaction between them. There was not much difference between the two types of hotels concerning these relationships.

8. CONCLUSIONS
The findings of the study lead to the understanding of job satisfaction in different types of hotels and reveal the roles of communication satisfaction and local culture as determinants of job satisfaction. We highlight the importance of examining Confucian work dynamism when evaluating the level of job satisfaction in China. We conclude that as much as these hotels want to meet the global hotel management standards, they must adapt to local cultural expectations and conditions. It is essential that hotel stakeholders, whether internationally or domestically operated, entering Hainan’s hospitality market to fully appreciate the influence of Chinese working culture as the study implied that communication factor cannot be regarded as the only predictor of job satisfaction in the Chinese hotel industry.

One limitation of this study concerns the measurement of cultural construct. A quantitative paradigm was used to measure Confucian work dynamism. Although the quantitative measurement was deduced from past studies, qualitative research methods, such as in-depth interviews or focus groups, might result in a more comprehensive understanding of how and why Confucian work dynamism factors have an effect on job satisfaction. Moreover, this study only focused on five-star hotels in Hainan, hence the generalizability of this research finding may be limited. Consequently, future studies might incorporate other types of hotels in Hainan, such as lower star rated hotels, economic chain hotels, and so forth, for a more representative result.

9. REFERENCES

Wang Hua & Bahiyah Omar

Examining Communication Satisfaction, Confucian Work Dynamism and Job Satisfaction: A Comparative Study of International and Domestic Hotels in Hainan, China


Ms. Wang Hua is attached with University Sains Malaysia, where she obtained her Masters in Communication. Her research areas are organizational communication and human communication.

Dr. Bahiyah Omar is a senior lecturer at the School of Communication, Universiti Sains Malaysia. She received her PhD in Arts from Monash University, Australia. Her research interests include new media, online journalism and communication studies.